

Committee for Public Counsel Services Immigration Impact Unit

6 Pleasant Street, 6th floor, Malden, MA 02148 Tel: 781-338-0825 – Fax: 781-338-0829 iiu@publiccounsel.net

Jennifer Klein
DIRECTOR

ANTHONY J. BENEDETTI

CHIEF COUNSEL

Demystifying Removal Proceedings

This advisory takes you through the various stages of removal proceedings to provide an overview of the process. It also explains key terms that may be relevant to your noncitizen clients.

The Basics of Removal

What does it mean to be removable?

Removable is a term that includes both inadmissible and/or deportable. For a noncitizen to be legally and/or physically removed from the United States by ICE, an immigration judge must first find that they are removable.

An immigrant is *inadmissible* when they are not eligible for admission to the U.S. because one or more of the grounds of inadmissibility set out in 8 U.S.C. § 1182 apply to them. An "admission" means legal entry into the U.S.; therefore, an immigrant who physically enters the U.S. without inspection is not considered to have been admitted. 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(13). There are many different grounds of inadmissibility, which include both lack of immigration status (i.e. being undocumented) as well as different criminal grounds.

• Admissibility applies in many different scenarios. For example, a person must prove that they are admissible when applying for a green card. Or a lawful permanent resident ("LPR" or "green card holder") may have to prove admissibility if they are returning from a trip abroad and have certain criminal convictions on their record.

An immigrant is *deportable* when they have already been admitted to the U.S. in any status, including on a temporary visa or as a permanent resident, and one or more of the grounds of deportability under 8 U.S.C. § 1227 apply to them.

• Like inadmissibility, there are many different kinds of deportability. For our clients, they may be deportable if they are a green card holder, visa holder, or refugee convicted of certain criminal offenses.

If my client is undocumented/removable, is there anything I can do in their criminal case?

Yes! Undocumented people, in some circumstances may be eligible to apply for lawful status. This is true even if they have already been placed in removal proceedings. For those with lawful immigration status, some people may apply for a "second chance" or apply for a different form of immigration status. This is called "removal defense" or "relief from removal." If a person succeeds in obtaining lawful status, their deportation will stop.

Examples:

- Your client entered the United States with a visa but that visa has since expired and so she is now undocumented. She marries a U.S. citizen and wants to apply for a green card. Although she is already removable because she is undocumented, you can help her preserve her eligibility for a green card by avoiding grounds of inadmissibility.
- Your client entered the United States without lawful status. He was apprehended at the border and is now applying for asylum. Although he may be undocumented and in removal proceedings, you can help him by avoiding certain crimes that will bar asylum.
- Your client is a green card holder who is deportable because she was previously
 convicted of two larcenies. Although she may be deportable, she may be eligible to apply
 for removal defense after being placed in removal proceedings. Helping her avoid certain
 criminal convictions may help her get a "second chance" in immigration court and stop
 her deportation.

ICE Arrest and Detention

Will my client be placed in immigration detention?

Immigrants are placed in immigration detention under a variety of circumstances. By statute, ICE has the authority to detain anyone pending a decision on removal as well as anyone with an outstanding removal order. 8 U.S.C. 1226(a). This means that ICE has the authority to detain undocumented people with no criminal record. However, anytime a person interacts with the criminal legal system, it increases their chances of being arrested by ICE.

If your client is in state custody, ICE may issue a detainer. There are three reasons why ICE would issue a detainer against your client:

- 1) ICE believes that your client is already removable based on lack of immigration status or because of criminal convictions.
- 2) Your client is already in removal proceedings because they are inadmissible or deportable.
- 3) Your client has already been ordered deported. In these circumstances, the detainer will say that your client has a prior order of removal and ICE is taking your client into its custody to actually deport them.

ICE has discretion with respect to which immigrants it will detain. Immigrants with final orders of removal or criminal convictions, particularly if they are subject to mandatory detention under 8 U.S.C. § 1226(c), will likely be detained.

Learn more about ICE detainers and representing clients detained by ICE at our website.

Where does ICE hold its detainees?

Plymouth County Correctional Facility is the only facility in Massachusetts that houses ICE detainees. ICE also frequently transfers its detainees to larger, ICE-operated detention facilities in other states, depending on the amount of detention space it has available. In most cases, they will have their immigration hearings at a court in that jurisdiction.

Information on ICE detention facilities throughout the U.S. is available at this website: https://ice.gov/detention-facilities.

You or your client's family can find out where ICE is holding your client by searching on the ICE detainee locater website: https://locator.ice.gov/odls/#/search.

ICE will generally not divulge its intentions to transfer a particular individual out of state until the transfer has already taken place.

The Stages of Removal Proceedings

Does my client have a right to appointed counsel in removal proceedings?

No. By statute, your client is not entitled to appointed counsel, but they are allowed to hire an attorney at their own expense. 8 U.S.C. §§ 1229a(a)(4); see also Matter of Lozada, 19 I&N Dec. 637 (BIA 1988) (setting the standard for ineffective assistance of counsel claims in removal proceedings). Removal proceedings are considered civil in nature. Immigrants are only protected by the Fifth Amendment right to due process during their proceedings, which means that they have a right to a fundamentally fair hearing, and a right to present evidence, examine evidence against them, and cross-examine witnesses. 8 U.S.C. § 1229a(a)(4)(B). The Immigration Court is required to provide immigrants with a list of local organizations that provide low-cost or free immigration representation. 8 U.S.C. § 1229(b)(2). This list is available here. However, the demand for assistance heavily exceeds the resources available.

What is a Notice to Appear?

To commence removal proceedings, DHS must prepare a charging document called a Notice to Appear ("NTA") and serve it on your client. 8 U.S.C. § 1229. A sample is attached at the end of this advisory. This document sets out the reasons that DHS believes your client is removable. In most cases, noncitizens have the burden of proving that they are not removable by clear and convincing evidence. 8 U.S.C. § 1229a(c)(2). However, for a person previously admitted (examples include green card holders or visa holders), the burden of proof is on DHS.

When will my client have their first hearing in Immigration Court?

After ICE arrests your client and prepares the Notice to Appear ("NTA," see above), it files the NTA with the Immigration Court. If your client is in detention, this will usually take at least 1-2 weeks. It can take much longer if your client is not detained. The court clerk then assigns your client to a judge and schedules them for a "master calendar hearing," which is a preliminary hearing. If your client is not in custody, they will receive written notice in the mail of this hearing. See 8 U.S.C. § 1229(a). Sometimes immigrants do not receive their Notice of Hearing, particularly if they change their address after encountering DHS. In these circumstances, they can check the date and time of their hearing here.

Can my client get released from immigration custody?

In some circumstances, Immigration Judges have the authority to review ICE's determination to detain an immigrant. They can release immigrants from custody on their own recognizance or on a bond of not less than \$1500. 8 U.S.C. § 1226(a). Your client can request a bond hearing at any time, even before the Notice to Appear has been filed with the Immigration Court.

There are certain categories of immigrants who are not entitled to bond redetermination hearings in Immigration Court:

- Arriving aliens (see 8 C.F.R. § 1003.19(h)(2)(B));
- Immigrants subject to mandatory detention under 8 U.S.C. § 1226(c), which generally include those who have committed crimes involving moral turpitude, drug offenses, aggravated felonies, firearms offenses, or engaged in terrorism, espionage, or otherwise threatened national security.

If ICE has decided not to release immigrants that fall into either of these categories, they will remain in custody while their removal proceedings are pending. However, if there is an argument that your client may be entitled to a bond redetermination hearing, they are allowed to request a hearing. 8 C.F.R. § 1003.19(h)(2)(ii); *Matter of Joseph*, 22 I&N Dec. 799 (BIA 1999). This is called a "Joseph hearing."

Bond decisions, including the decision about whether an immigrant is subject to mandatory detention, can be appealed to the Board of Immigration Appeals. 8 C.F.R. § 1003.1(b)(7). They can also be contested through a writ of habeas corpus. If DHS decides to appeal a bond decision, it can request a stay on the release of your client until the appeal is decided. 8 C.F.R. § 1003.19(i).

What happens at the client's first hearing in Immigration Court?

The first hearing in court is called a master calendar hearing. At this hearing, the Immigration Judge will inquire as to whether your client has counsel or would like to hire counsel. If your client needs more time to find counsel, the Judge will give them at least one continuance for that purpose. If your client already has counsel, or wishes to proceed *pro se*, the Judge will then ask

them to submit pleadings or otherwise answer the charges on the Notice to Appear and advise the court as to the relief that they are seeking.

After pleadings are submitted, the Judge will ask DHS to prove the charges on the Notice to Appear. If the charges are sustained and your client is found removable, the judge will set a deadline for your client to submit any applications for relief, and they will also schedule your client for an "individual hearing," or merits hearing, to present testimony in support of those applications.

If your client is applying for relief, they will need to fill out the appropriate application and submit it to the court by the deadline set by the judge. Failure to follow deadlines set by the court can result in an order of removal after a finding that your client has forfeited all relief.

If your client is in detention and eligible for bond, the judge will hold a bond redetermination hearing. Bond hearings are separate proceedings and evidence submitted during a bond hearing is kept separate from your client's removal file. 8 C.F.R. § 1003.19(d). If your client is thinking of hiring counsel, they should wait to proceed with their bond hearing until they have counsel because bond decisions are not easily appealed.

Detained cases are on a special, expedited court calendar. Thus, if your client is in custody, they can expect their case to be heard within a matter of weeks. Non-detained cases are on a much slower calendar. Your client may have to wait years before they have their individual hearing.

What happens during an individual hearing?

An individual hearing, also known as a merits hearing, is the closest thing that the Immigration Court has to a full-fledged trial. Before this hearing, your client will be required to submit any applications for relief and evidence in support of these applications. On the day of the hearing, your client will testify, be cross-examined, present supporting witnesses, and cross-examine any Homeland Security witnesses. For all forms of removal defense, the burden of proof is on your client, and they will be expected to testify in support of their application. *See, e.g., Matter of Fefe,* 20 I&N Dec. 116 (BIA 1989).

At the end of the individual hearing, the judge may decide the case orally or may continue the case so that they can prepare a written decision. 8 C.F.R. § 1003.37. At the end of proceedings, the immigration judge will either (1) terminate proceedings because the noncitizen is not removable as charged, (2) grant the application for removal defense, or (3) order the person be removed from the United States.

What if my client is ordered deported?

If the immigration judge decides to order your client removed, your client is allowed to appeal that decision to the Board of Immigration Appeals. 8 C.F.R. § 1003.1(b). On the day that the judge makes their decision, your client is required to reserve appeal of that decision. Your client then has 30 days to submit a Notice of Appeal to the Board. 8 C.F.R. §§ 1003.3, 1003.38.

If the BIA also orders your client removed, there are limited circumstances in which your client may be allowed to file a Petition for Review with the U.S. Court of Appeals. 8 U.S.C. § 1252. A Petition for Review must be filed within 30 days of the BIA's decision. 8 U.S.C. § 1252(b).

My client was just ordered deported. When will they be deported?

After an immigrant is ordered deported, they are required to cooperate in effectuating their deportation by providing ICE with their passport or identity documents, if available. *See, e.g.,* 8 C.F.R. § 241.13(d)(2). ICE will make arrangements with the consulate of the country to which your client will be deported. In some cases, deportation will take a few weeks; in other circumstances, particularly if your client or the consulate is not cooperative, deportation can take months. For security reasons, ICE will not usually divulge the exact date of an immigrant's deportation until after the deportation occurs. If your client has been ordered deported but is not in custody, ICE has the authority to arrest and detain them to deport them. 8 U.S.C. § 1231(a)(2); 8 C.F.R. § 241.

My client was ordered deported almost six months ago, but they are still in custody and have not been deported yet. What can they do?

Once your client has been ordered deported, ICE is required to review your client's custody status 90 days after the final order and 180 days after the final order, as required by the landmark U.S. Supreme Court case of *Zadvydas v. Davis*, 533 U.S. 678 (2001). *See also* 8 C.F.R. § 241.4. Your client is required to cooperate in the deportation arrangements. Usually, only immigrants from countries that do not have repatriation agreements with the U.S. are released at the 90-day custody review. After 180 days of post-order custody, ICE is required to release anyone for whom there is "no significant likelihood of removal in the reasonably foreseeable future." 8 C.F.R. § 241.13. Thus, your client can request a custody review at the 90-day mark and the 180-day mark, and in most cases will be released from custody after 180 days.

A more in depth explanation of immigration law and immigration court can be found in our *Immigration Impact Unit Guide*.

If you have specific questions about your client's removal proceedings, the CPCS Immigration Impact Unit is available for individual consultation. Please fill out an <u>IIU</u> intake form and e-mail it to iiu@publiccounsel.net

U. S. Department of Justice Immigration and Naturalization Serv	ice		Notice to Appear
	nder section 240 of the Immigr	ation and Nationality Act	
13 Iconoval providence		File l' Case N	
	_= V3		· 8
In the Matter of:	Title 1		currently residing at:
Responden	2 18	4 143	102. 254 2 7 6 =
<u> </u>	(Number, street, city state and ZIP or	de)	(Vaes code and hyone anaport)
 1. You are an arriving alien. 2. You are an alien present in 3. You have been admitted to 	the United States who has not been admitted United States, but are deportable for	nitted or paroled. The reasons stated below.	
The Service alleges that you			
			8
See Continuation P	age Made a Part Hereof		,
	0	Œ	
On the hasis of the foregoing, it is	s charged that you are subject to remove	al from the United States pursuant	to the following
provision(s) of law:	,		
	E.		الإراد .
See Continuation Pa	ege Made a Part Hereof		
This notice is being issued af or torture.	ter an asylum officer has found that the s	espondent has demonstrated a cre-	lible fear of persecution
Section 235(b)(1) order was	variated pursuant to: 🔲 8 CFR 208.30(f)(2)	
YOU ARE ORDERED to appear JFK Federal Building 15 sudb	before an immigration judge of the Unit very Street Room 320 Boston MASSAC	U025419 09 05403	13
	(Complete Address of Immigration Court, Inc. a time to be set to show why you	dudiae Room Number, if any)	nited States based on the
(bate) charge(s) set forth above.	(Time)	AUL STEAL AND THE LOCAL PROPERTY OF THE PROPER	
		(Signature and Title of Issuing	(Officer)
Date: #19 19 2004	B	Oston, MA (City and State)	

Notice to Respondent

Warning: Any statement you make may be used against you in removal proceedings.

Alien Registration: This copy of the Notice to Appear served upon you is evidence of your alien registration while you are under removal proceedings. You are required to carry it with you at all times.

Representation: If you so choose, you may be represented in this proceeding, at no expense to the Government, by an attorney or other individual authorized and qualified to represent persons before the Executive Office for Immigration Review, pursuant to 8 CFR 3.16. Unless you so request, no hearing will be scheduled earlier than ten day; from the date of this notice to allow you sufficient time to secure counsel. A list of qualified attorneys and organizations who may be available to represent you at no cost will be provided with this Notice.

Conduct of the hearing: At the time of your hearing, you should bring with you any affidavits or other documents which you desire to have considered in connection with your case. If any document is in a foreign language, you must bring the original and a certified English translation of the document. If you wish to have the testimony of any witnesses considered, you should arrange to have such witnesses present at the hearing.

At your hearing you will be given the opportunity to admit or deny any or all of the allegations in the Notice to Appear and that you are inadmissible or deportable on the charges contained in the Notice to Appear. You will have an opportunity to present evidence on your own behalf, to examine any evidence presented by the Government, to object, on proper legal grounds, to the receipt of evidence and to cross examine any witnesses presented by the Government. At the conclusion of your hearing, you have a right to appeal an adverse decision by the immigration judge.

You will be advised by the immigration judge before whom you appear, of any relief from removal for which you may appear eligible including the privilege of departing voluntarily. You will be given a reasonable opportunity to make any such application to the immigration judge.

Failure to appear: You are required to provide the INS, in writing, with your full mailing address and telephone number. You must notify the Immigration Court immediately by using Form BOIR-33 whenever you change your address or telephone number during the course of this proceeding. You will be provided with a copy of this form. Notices of hearing will be mailed to this address. If you do not submit Form EOIR-33 and do not otherwise provide an address at which you may be reached during proceedings, then the Government shall not be required to provide you with written notice of your hearing. If you fail to attend the hearing at the time and place designated on this notice, or any date and time later directed by the Immigration Court, a removal order may be made by the immigration judge in your absence, and you may be arrested and detained by the INS.

Request for Prompt Hearing To expedite a determination in my case, I request an immediate hearing. I waive my right to have a 10-day period prior to appearing before an immigration judge. (Signature of Respondent) Before: (Signature and Title of INS Officer) Certificate of Service , in the following manner and in This Notice to Appear was served on the respondent by me on compliance with section 239(a)(1)(F) of the Act: by regular mail by certified mail, return receipt requested X in person Attached is a credible fear worksheet. Attached is a list of organizations and attorneys which provide free legal services. language of the time and place of his or her hearing The alien was provided oral notice in the English and of the consequences of failure to appear as provided in section 240(b)(7) of the Act. 1001 GRATION AGE of Respondent if Personally Served)

partment of Justice	(a).	Continuation age for For	m 1-862
ration and Naturalization Service	File Number	Date	
		May 19, 20	04
The Service alleges that you:			
1) You are not a citizen or nation			
.2) You are a native of Haiti and a			E Ät
3) You were admitted to the United 1993 as an immigrant;		×.	
4) You were, on 2003, conv Massachusetts for the offense of class D controlled substance, t Section 32 of the Massachusetts	of Possession wit To wit: Marijuan	abridge District Cour th the intent to dist a, in violation of Ch	tibuce a
On the basis of the foregoing, it is charged the provision(s) of law:	at you are subject to re	emoval from the United States	pursuant to the following
Section 237(a)(2)(A)!iii) of the amended, in that, at any time a aggravated felony as defined in relating to the illicit traffic section 102 of the Controlled Scrime, as defined in section 92	Section 101(a) king in a control	(43) (B) of the Act, a clied substance, as d including a drug traf	n offense escribed in ficking
•			

Title

SUPERVISORY SPECIAL AGENT

Signature

PAUL STERLAN

DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY IMMIGRATION DETAINER - NOTICE OF ACTION

Subject ID: Event #:		File No: Date:
TO: (Name and Title of Institution - OR Any Subseque Enforcement Agency)	ent Law	FROM: (Department of Homeland Security Office Address)
MAINTAIN CUSTODY	OF ALIEN FOR A	PERIOD NOT TO EXCEED 48 HOURS
Name of Alien: Date of Birth:	NI-41 114	200
THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND S THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ABOVE, CURRI	SECURITY (DHS) H. ENTLY IN YOUR CU	IAS TAKEN THE FOLLOWING ACTION RELATED TO USTODY:
 Determined that there is reason to believe the all that apply): has a prior a felony conviction or has been confernse; 		en subject to removal from the United States. The individual (check has been convicted of illegal entry pursuant to 8 U.S.C. § 1325;
 has three or more prior misdemeanor convic has a prior misdemeanor conviction or has be misdemeanor for an offense that involves vic 	een charged with a	 has illegally re-entered the country after a previous removal or return;
assaults; sexual abuse or exploitation; driving of alcohol or a controlled substance; unlawful scene of an accident; the unlawful possession or other deadly weapon, the distribution or tracetorical controlled substance; or other significant three	g under the influence I flight from the on or use of a firearm afficking of a	therwise poses a significant risk to national security horde
	Notice to Appear or ot	ther charging document. A copy of the charging document is
Served a warrant of arrest for removal proce	edings. A copy of the	e warrant is attached and was served on (da
Obtained an order of deportation or removal		·
assignments, or other matters. DHS discoura		ted to this person's custody classification, work, quarter minal charges based on the existence of a detainer.
IT IS REQUESTED THAT YOU:		
the time when the subject would have otherwing request derives from federal regulation 8 C.F. the subject beyond these 48 hours. As early DHS by calling during busine	se been released from R. § 287.7. For purpor y as possible prior to the ss hours or the ICE Law Enforce	HOURS, excluding Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays, beyond m your custody to allow DHS to take custody of the subject. This oses of this immigration detainer, you are not authorized to hold the time you otherwise would release the subject, please notify after hours or in an emergency. If you cannot reach a cement Support Center in Burlington, Vermont at: (802) 872-6020.
Notify this office of the time of release at least		ease or as far in advance as possible.
Notify this office in the event of the inmate's		·
Consider this request for a detainer operative	•	
Cancel the detainer previously placed by this	s Office on	(date).
(Name and title of Immigration Officer)	(Signature of Immigration Officer)
Please provide the information below, sign, and	CEMENT AGENCY (return to DHS using the	(Signature of Immigration Officer) CURRENTLY HOLDING THE SUBJECT OF THIS NOTICE: the envelope enclosed for your convenience or by faxing a copy or your own records so you may track the case and not hold the
Local Booking/Inmate #: Late	est criminal charge/cor	nviction: (date) Estimated release:(date)
Last criminal charge/conviction:		\ ,
Notice: Once in our custody, the subject of this		oved from the United States. If the individual may be the victim of prosecution or other law enforcement purposes, including acting

DHS Form I-247 (12/12) Page 1 of

(Signature of Officer)

(Name and title of Officer)